CHAPTER 8

Between Catholic Nationalism and Inter-religious Cosmopolitanism
Religious Heritage in Fátima and Mouraria, Portugal
Anna Fedele and José Mapril

Introduction

This chapter is based on long-term ethnographic research in Portugal and explores the tensions between two tendencies present in the Portuguese governance of religious sites and heritages: on one hand, we find a desire of preservation of a Catholic, nationalist, "pure" Portugal and, on the other, the drive to affirm this country's international, inter-religious, and inter-cultural landscape. These two tendencies will be revealed in the context of two ethnographic case studies: the pilgrimage site of Fátima, and the Mouraria square project in Lisbon. We will argue that the tensions at the core of this chapter are linked to processes of (re)imagining national identity and belonging, through the mobilization of ideas about what constitutes Portuguese religious heritage and roots (see Salemink, Stengs, and van den Hemel, introduction).

As the editors of the present volume argue, "Religious heritage thus becomes implicated in narratives about who belongs and who does not, which religious sites and traditions should be funded, and who gets to decide what a cityscape has meant in the past, does mean in the present, and will mean in the future" (introduction, p. 4). Following this lead, we analyze "how heritage regimes are instrumentalized, adapted, changed, hacked, and turned inside out by different groups and societal actors that claim to have a stake in the cultural heritage and its management" (p. 10). As the other contributors to this volume, we focus on the intersections of religion and heritage and

avoid reducing our case studies of heritagization only to a larger "regime" or stable power discourse imposed from above. Through our ethnographic approach we take into consideration the role of Catholic religion in heritage management not only from a top-down but also from a bottom-up perspective. We therefore analyze the frequent disconnections and disruptions existing between the dynamics of the management of religious sites and the uses people make of these sites from below. We also reflect on what these disruptions tell us about processes of political claims making and citizenship.

A second argument that comes through in this chapter is precisely how the aforementioned tensions are related to processes of domestication of non-Christian groups through the creation of "proper" places for religious minorities and its heritages that stand in contrast with religious majorities and their corresponding heritages. The cases of Fátima and Mouraria represent important examples because they can be seen as the core symbols of two important sources of heritage in Portugal: if Fátima stands for the nation's strong roots in Catholicism and its particularly fervent devotion to Our Lady, Mouraria stands for its Muslim past as well as for its large history of colonization.

Fátima is one of Europe's most important Catholic pilgrimage shrines and a good example of the changing meanings and competing discourses associated with pilgrimage sites (Eade and Sallnow 1991; Coleman and Eade 2018). Constructed as a patriotic altar during the military dictatorship until 1974 and as a bastion for an international "war against Communism," Fátima has also been creatively used by its international pilgrims as well as by Portuguese pilgrims who see Our Lady of Fátima first and foremost as "their" Mother (Fedele 2020a, 2020b). In the last decades, religious minorities such as Muslims, Hindus, New Agers, and others have made their own pilgrimages to Fátima, with or without the approval of local institutions or the support of advocates of inter-religious dialogue. There is a tension between a desire to maintain a sort of "pure," Portuguese, and Catholic Fátima and the need to demonstrate the country's modernity and openness, promoting a global Catholic Fátima that is also open to interculturality and in favor of inter-religious dialogue.

In a similar way, in the case of Mouraria square, one can observe two processes happening simultaneously. The first process could be described as the top-down heritagization of the Islamic past of Lisbon that relates to the current politics of religious diversity in Portugal and in Europe (Astor, Burchardt, and Griera 2017, Astor 2019; Hirschkind 2016). For city hall, the Moorish square, with its Al-Andalus reference and the presence of a mosque, is the recognition of an Islamic past of the city, an Islamic heritage that is more and more visible through several archaeological findings. This contemporary mobilization of ideas about religious diversity and heritage,

past and present, is a major change in relation to the Estado Novo period (1933–74). During this dictatorship, the Mouraria quarter was seen as a morally decaying urban area that needed disciplining and in which several events promoted hegemonic representations of national identity in relation to Christianity, more generally, and Catholicism, in particular. This project produced a discourse that totally silenced nineteenth-century archaeological findings of the Islamic presence in the city and, simultaneously, reified the image, highly Orientalized, of the Islamic other, defeated in the twelfth century. Thus, the current recognition of the Al-Andalus past as something valuable is in radical contrast in relation to the Estado Novo period.

The second process, related to a bottom-up appropriation of Mouraria, is best exemplified by the relocation of a pre-existing mosque to the new square. This relocation is for Mapril's interlocutors—Portuguese-Bangladeshi Muslims—the recognition of their *right to the city* through the creation of a proper place to practice their religion—a claim of more than ten years. In this case, the heritage regime created the condition for the emergence of a distinct Muslim subjectivity (in relation to the main institutional representatives of Portuguese public Islam) and was appropriated (in a bottom-up process) to make a new place for lived Islam—albeit in a discretely visible place.

Although the case studies of Fátima and Mouraria may at first glance seem to be heritage sites with quite different characteristics, because the first is an explicitly religious place, while the other is a public square, only indirectly related to (Islamic) religion, the analysis of the ways in which their management, in terms of heritagization, takes place shows several elements in common. In both cases we have a tension between top-down processes of heritagization and a bottom-up appropriation of the space by religious actors. We also have two competing (and almost opposite) approaches, one emphasizing nationalist, purist discourses and the other focusing on intercultural and inter-religious discourses. Even if these tensions may seem specific for the Portuguese case, we will argue that similar processes are happening in other European contexts and more specifically in southern European societies. To understand such processes in Portugal, as in Italy and Spain, it is essential to pinpoint the role of the Catholic heritage in the definition of the "religious" in the public domain and ultimately in the construction of national identity and imaginaries.

To develop these arguments, we will firstly contextualize the relations between religion, heritage, and the public sphere in Portugal, in its historical and contemporary dimensions. This is essential to reveal the present and past relations between religion, patrimonialization processes, and hegemonic representations of Portuguese national identity. This section sets the scene for the two ethnographic case studies—Fátima and the Mouraria

square project—that will be developed in the next two sections. We will then discuss these cases and proceed to the conclusions.

Religion, Heritage, and the Public Domain in Portugal

To understand some of the dynamics and processes around the two case studies of Fátima and Mouraria, it is essential to explore the role of the "religious" as practice and discourse in the Portuguese public domain and how it is connected with specific ideas about national identity and heritage, as it is analyzed in the chapter by Cardeira da Silva and Saraiva (this volume). As they explain, the construction of a national identity was, from the start, linked to Catholicism. When, in the twelfth century, the first Portuguese king proclaimed the independence from other Iberian kingdoms, this victory was also based on his achievements against the Muslims that occupied the peninsula. What Afonso Henriques proclaimed was a victory of Christianity, which was carried on by his successors in the following centuries. The main historical events of the country remained directly connected to the Catholic Church, and in spite of periods of tensions and ambiguities, the long-established relations between the monarchy and the church perpetuated the idea that Catholicism was the religion of the kingdom (Vilaça 2006). This situation lasted until the liberal revolution at the end of the nineteenth century, which brought about a proclaimed triumph of *laicité* (secularism) and the extinction of religious orders. The notion of a possible secular nation was further implemented with the proclamation of the republic in 1910 and a certain opening to religious pluralism during the First Republic (Vilaça and Oliveira 2019). In fact, during this period some new religious groups such as Protestant churches, Jehovah's Witnesses, Spiritists, and even Baha'i followers came to the country.

Under the Salazar dictatorship (1933), the ties between the state and the church were reinforced once again through a nonofficial but evident mutual support in many political and social decisions, as in the case of Portuguese Christian missions in the overseas colonies. Initially, the Estado Novo dictatorship proclaimed a national identity that was deeply Catholic, anti-Protestant, and suspicious, even if slightly tolerant, of other religious groups. The existence of an important Islamic heritage in Portugal was completely silenced, despite the numerous archaeological findings that proved its relevance (Cardeira da Silva 2005), thereby creating a nation imagined as Catholic and built against the presence of Muslims. Later, though, a lusotropical rhetoric was extensively adopted, with the desire to project "a positive external image" of Portugal that had important implications also on the ways in which heritage was managed (see Cardeira da Silva and Saraiva, this vol-

ume). It is in this context that during the liberation wars in Portugal's former colonial territories, the Estado Novo regime looked very suspiciously at Muslims in Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau and tried to create its own "brand" of Portuguese Islam (which could be used to show, according to the argument, the Portuguese "soft colonization"), a brand that met the resistance of some of the key Islamic figures (Vakil, Monteiro, and Machaqueiro 2011).

It was finally with the 1974 revolution that the social and religious scenario in Portugal underwent drastic alterations. In fact, although Portugal is still frequently described as a "traditionally" Catholic country, much has changed in the past decades due mainly to different types of mobilities (of people, ideas, and institutions). Even if Portugal is still usually perceived as an emigration country, in the last quarter of a century it has also become a country of immigration. The democratic transition, European integration, and implementation of the Schengen Agreement changed the position of Portugal regarding global migration flows (see, for instance, Castles and Miller 1997; King et al. 2000). These include the arrival not only of populations with historical/colonial connections with Portugal—such as Cape Verdeans, Guineans, and Angolans, to mention just a few—but also of populations with no prior links to Portugal. Chinese, Bangladeshis, Pakistanis, Senegalese, and populations from central and eastern Europe—Romania, Ukraine, Moldavia—are now part and parcel of Lisbon's sociocultural makeup. With these flows, which began in the 1960s but increased significantly from the late '80s onward, with its corresponding diversities, the religious landscape became much more complex (see Blanes and Mapril 2013; Cardeira da Silva and Saraiva, this volume).

Beyond the Catholic majority, Portugal nowadays has a large variety of Christian Orthodox, Protestants, Evangelicals and Pentecostals, Muslims, Jews, Mormons, Moonies, Buddhists, New Agers, Afro-Brazilians, and other religious minorities. It is also important to acknowledge that these more recent diversities were not opposed to a homogeneous (Catholic) past (Blanes and Mapril 2013). However, although religious pluralism and diversities were historically present in the country, it is also essential to acknowledge the current complexities and their relations with wider transformations in the past decades. Whereas in the discussion of the European Constitution the reference to the Christian roots of Europe stirred a considerable debate, the reference to a Portuguese heritage rooted in Christianity in general and Catholicism in particular did not cause too many conflicts. Nevertheless, discussions on religious pluralism were carried out in the Parliament in the 1990s, and the new religious law was approved in 2001, followed by, in 2004, the creation of the Commission for Religious Freedom.

It is in this scenario of contemporary religious variety that the two case studies of Fátima and Mouraria, which we will explore in more detail in the

following two sections, come into play. These two examples allow us to address, from specific social locations, what constitutes the contemporary Portuguese public domain and its various concepts of heritage, focusing on its geographies of power and its ambiguities dealing with religion.

Although in Fátima the supremacy of Catholicism in terms of heritage becomes particularly evident, the authorities in charge of the management of the shrine also stimulate the development of a national and global devotion to Our Lady of Fátima that goes beyond the local cult. The result is a cult deeply engrained in a Portuguese national imaginary, and heritage, that is also open to the world and to other religions. However, as we will see, this openness has its rules and restrictions, resulting in what can be described as an ecumenism led by Catholicism.

The new Mouraria square, on the other hand, evokes the current changes in the Portuguese religioscape (Turner 2011), with different actors, projects, and heritages. This politics of religious diversities, though, is intimately connected with a public domain in which several segments, led by the Catholic Church, claim a new place for the "religious" (Mapril et al. 2017). Within these dynamics, the place of religious minorities (and by implication majority) is of paramount importance.

Fátima: From National(ist) Marian Shrine to Global Religious Heritage Site

A small Portuguese village clustered around a parish church, Fátima started attracting public attention after 13 May 1917, when three children reported having a vision that was later officially recognized by ecclesiastic authorities as an authentic Marian apparition. Fátima is currently a global Catholic pilgrimage site that also encompasses the village of Aljustrel and the area that is now the town of Cova da Iria-Fátima.

The processes of authentication and validation of this religious site as well as the gradual transformations of the meanings ascribed to Our Lady of Fátima during the last one hundred years are complex. They need to be understood not only in the context of the national political scenario in Portugal discussed above but also taking into account the increasing occurrence of Marian apparitions since the end of the nineteenth century and the gradual importance given to Marian apparition sites as well as to the figure of Mary within Catholicism (Christian 1996; Claverie 2003; Orsi 2010; Zimdars-Swartz 1991; Perry and Echevarria 1988). The following historical overview is therefore necessarily reductive and has the aim to provide the readers with the information necessary to follow Fátima's evolution from a national(ist) Marian shrine to a global religious heritage site. Thus the case of Fátima pro-

vides a privileged window upon the influence of nationalist discourses on heritage practices in Portugal.

On 13 May 1917, three children, Lucia Santos and Jacinta and Francisco Marto, now known as the three little shepherds (*os três pastorinhos*), reported having seen a lady dressed in white, which they soon identified as being Our Lady. As we have seen above, the First Portuguese Republic had a rather anticlerical attitude. The children grew up in a climate of worry and fear related to the international political situation, the separation of the state and the church, and increasing attacks against priests and proprieties of the church. After reporting their visions, the children were treated as liars by some and revered as visionaries by others; nevertheless worship in Fátima started to develop steadily, especially after the so-called Miracle of the Sun on 13 October 1917, when a large crowd assembled at Fátima reported seeing the sun move and shine in unusual ways, after a prophesy of the three children.

With the beginning of the military dictatorship in 1926, an auspicious period for the devotion in Fátima started. Eager to distance itself from the anticlerical positions of the republican period, the new government endorsed Fátima as a patriotic altar. This process became particularly evident when Our Lady of Fátima was crowned as queen of Portugal in 1942 with a golden crown made from jewelry given by Portuguese women as an offering for Our Lady's intercession to avoid Portugal's participation in World War II. Through the figure of the queen of Portugal (*rainha de Portugal*), a title used in what became the official hymn of Our Lady of Fátima, a strong link between Fátima, the Portuguese state, and the Portuguese population was created. This link was widely used to legitimize the dictatorship of Salazar as well as to encourage the colonial wars (e.g., Zimdars-Swartz 1991; Torgal 2011, 2017). Still today survivors of colonial wars go on pilgrimage to Fátima with their fellow soldiers to give thanks for coming home safe as well as to commemorate their participation in the wars. The crown of Our Lady, which is used only for the special celebrations held each year to commemorate the dates of the apparitions (see figure 8.1), gradually became a sacred object but also a piece that is jealously guarded and exhibited as part of the Portuguese heritage in the Museum of the Sanctuary.

Although it is clear that not all Catholics in Portugal, priests or laypeople, were in favor of the Estado Novo, Salazarism played an important role in the development of the devotion to Our Lady of Fátima in Portugal and in the consecration of Fátima as a patriotic altar. The link between Salazarism and Fátima remains a topic that has never really been clearly acknowledged by the exponents of the Catholic institutions in Portugal in the public space, and it is therefore still at the origin of fierce debates. While scholarship on Fátima has tended to focus on the analysis of the importance of this cult

Figure 8.1. The statue of Our Lady of Fátima during the crowded procession for the celebration of the centenary of the apparitions on 13 October 2017. Note the crown made of gold donated by Portuguese women. © Anna Fedele.

during Salazarism[1] and on its political dimension (e.g., Scheer 2006), other important aspects of this devotion have received little attention so far (but see Lopes 1989; Jansen and Kühl 2008; Pereira 2003; Fedele 2017, 2020a, 2020b; Gemzöe 2000). As we will show through our historical analysis, the cult to Our Lady of Fátima, with its top-down management as well as its bottom-up appropriations, is constantly changing. When Fedele was presenting her work in Portugal, she found that the audience almost always expected her to take sides, showing that she was in some way critical of Fátima devotion, linking it mainly to Salazarism, or that she was in some way "Catholic friendly" and therefore ready to minimize this political aspect. Fedele tried to explain that as an anthropologist she just wanted to understand devotion in Fátima, avoiding to reduce it only to its political dimension or only to one historical period, but this dichotomy was difficult to overcome.

Since the 1940s, replicas of the statue of Our Lady of Fátima conserved in the chapel of the apparition were created and sent out as pilgrimage statues, first to the rest of Portugal and then gradually to Spain, the rest of Europe, and the rest of the world. Pilgrim statues greatly increased international devotion, as did the activities of the Blue Army of Our Lady of Fátima. Founded in 1946 in the United States and later renamed the World Apostolate of Fátima, this organization fostered the association of Our Lady of Fátima with the devotion to the Immaculate Heart of Mary and as an important figure in the battle against the spread of communism.

After the revolution in 1974, the new government adopted a moderate position, as the nationalist aspect of Fátima was less emphasized and what Fedele describes below as the global Fátima discourse gradually became more and more important. Our Lady of Fátima increasingly became a symbol of international anticommunism through the pope's interpretation of his survival of an assassination attempt in 1981 as a consequence of the intervention of Our Lady of Fátima. In this context, the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989 and the decline of the Soviet Union were interpreted as the triumph of Our Lady, and a piece of the Berlin Wall was displayed at the Sanctuary of Fátima and now forms part of its permanent heritage. In 2000 the pope preceded the ceremony of beatification of Jacinta and Francisco, who had died shortly after the visions. After Lucia's death in 2005, her case was granted by Pope Benedict XVI an accelerated process of beatification.

In 2016 and 2017, with the celebration of the centenary of the apparitions in Fátima, the visit of Pope Francis, and the sanctification of Jacinta and Francisco, the relevance of this site as a high place of global Catholicism and an important European heritage site was sanctioned once again. Through the constant attention of the Portuguese media and the celebration of the apparitions in 2016 and 2017 became a national event, implicating the president of the republic in the most important events. The national pilgrimages of 12–13 May 2017 paralyzed a part of the country and required the development of a huge apparatus of assistance and security measures.

Fátima is currently presented as a Catholic shrine of global religious significance but also as a national heritage shrine to be visited by tourists who wish to discover more about Portuguese culture and its religious traditions. In a brochure distributed by the local tourist office in 2017, Fátima was presented as an inter-religious site that increasingly attracted also non-Christian groups. This is not an entirely new phenomenon, since Hindus and Muslims living in Portugal have been visiting Fátima at least since the 1980s. It seems that with the turning of the new century, however, the visibility and public recognition of this phenomenon have become possible. The promotion of Fátima as a possible place for inter-religious worship, however, is still contested, as we will see in more detail below.

In Fátima we find two intertwined heritage discourses: a "nationalist Fátima" discourse, clearly influenced by a nationalist Portuguese imaginary, and a "global Fátima" discourse, which aims to reach through the entire world. These two discourses feed into each other. The importance of the worldwide cult of Fátima is used to endorse and demonstrate the international importance of Portugal worldwide, an association that emerged also from the discourse of the president of the republic on 13 October 2017. However there exist also tensions, especially when the global dimension of Fátima relates to its use by non-Christian religious groups living in Portugal. *Enciclopédia de Fátima* (Encyclopedia of Fátima) (Azevedo and Cristino 2007), written with the active participation of the Sanctuary of Fátima, recognizes the importance that Fátima had for Muslims living in Portugal. Hindus also visit Fátima regularly and often have statues of Our Lady in their shops and houses (Lourenço and Cachado 2018). Also, members of other religious communities visit Fátima and celebrate their rituals there—for instance, those related to alternative spiritualities (e.g.,New Age, Neo-Paganism, Neo-Shamanism), Afro-Brazilian religions, or groups practicing techniques more related to the culture of wellness such as meditation, mindfulness, or yoga. While some consider this inter-religious feature of Fátima an expression of the sacredness and powerfulness of the place, others feel the need to protect the "Catholicness" of Fátima. This tendency to protect Fátima from non-Christian religions became evident in 2004 after a Hindu priest was allowed to lead a ceremony at the chapel of the apparitions, which gave rise to fierce debates.[2] Those protesting against this inter-religious ceremony expressed through the Portuguese media their anger about the fact that the very heart of Portuguese Catholicism was being used to celebrate "pagan" rites.

These tensions between nationalist Fátima, seen as a religious heritage site that is only for the (Catholic) Portuguese, and global Fátima, seen as an international, even inter-religious heritage site, reflect the conflicting desires of preserving a Catholic Portugal and, alternatively, affirming its international, inter-religious grandiosity.

When we interviewed pilgrims, those coming from abroad were surprised to discover that non-Christian groups also visited Fátima. They usually saw this in a positive way, as a proof of the healing power of the shrines. Only those belonging to more conservative Catholic groups, such as the aforementioned Blue Army of Fátima, saw it as a potential threat and a silent takeover of Fátima by non-Christians. Many Portuguese pilgrims knew about non-Christian devotion in Fátima from the media and usually saw it as something obvious: since the healing power of Our Lady was great, other religious groups also wanted to ask for her help. Most of them also stated, however, that if other groups wanted to visit the shrine, they had to conform

to Catholic norms and rituals (see also Fedele 2020a, 2020b). The pilgrims' Catholic-centered ecumenism mirrors also the overall management of the shrine by Catholic authorities. They are proud to show that other religious groups also recognize Fátima as an important and sacred place, as long as their ritual use of it happens under the control of Catholic authorities.

The Moorish Square and Its Quarter: Between Heritage and Lived Religion

In the past years, a project for the construction of a new square, named praça da Mouraria, literally the Moorish square, was approved by the city council of Lisbon. This project was proposed in 2012 as part of a larger initiative to regenerate the Mouraria neighborhood, the Moorish quarter, a working-class area in the center of the city, which is historically seen as an ambiguous place. The Moorish quarter, or bairro da Mouraria, is the current name of an area of the city where Moors (Mouros in Portuguese) were allowed to live, in the areas surrounding the walls, after the conquest of Lisbon in the twelfth century. The Lisbon Moorish quarters were partially autonomous in relation to the rest of the city, with several infrastructures such as mosques, madrassas, cemeteries, etc. (Gaspar 1985). By the end of the fifteenth century, Moors and Jews were expelled or forced to convert, and with this an erasure of the presence of Muslim institutions and symbols took place.[3] Despite these processes of expulsion and iconoclasm, and during all the major transformations in the following centuries, this area of Lisbon retained this Moorish reference up to the present.

Over the next centuries, the Moorish quarter went through a series of transformations. Throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries it was the place of several crafts, such as ceramics and olive oil production, and references still linger to this day in the name of some of the streets in the area (Estevens 2018). In spite of its social marginalization, it was for a while attractive to members of the clergy, nobles, and rich members of the bourgeoisie, who built palaces in the upper side of Mouraria (Estevens 2018). By the late nineteenth century, and after remaining almost untouched by the earthquake of 1755, Mouraria became a working-class area, with a small bourgeoisie, and the place of unions, newspapers, associations, and several theaters. It was a republican area marked by the presence of several revolutionary and proletarian movements that criticized the increasing social inequalities and the monarchy (Estevens 2018).

During the Estado Novo dictatorship, Mouraria was perceived as the place of the "dangerous classes" and thus a place that needed disciplining. In this sense, several plans were developed to try to renovate the area, which

had an effective component of urban space transformation, but also aimed at a larger moral transformation, via hygienist architecture (Bastos 2015). Although never finalized, these plans left a deep mark in the area because of the demolitions carried out in lower Mouraria, a condition that was aggravated by the fire and demolition of a central market in the vicinity.

At the same time, Mouraria was still thought of as a religious place, through the procession of Our Lady of Health, the oldest in the city (dating from 1570)—today considered a city heritage. Soon after the implementation of the republic, in 1910, the procession was interrupted and later resumed during the Estado Novo, in the 1940s, in a context in which the dictatorship was appropriating the Catholic identity of Mouraria (together with Fado and the Marchas populares). For the dictatorship, Mouraria was the place to continuously celebrate the connections between a national imaginary and the central role of Catholicism in it. This project produced a discourse that silenced nineteenth-century archaeological findings of the Islamic presence in the city and painted a highly Orientalized image of the Muslim "Other," defeated in the twelfth century.

After 1974 and until the twentieth century, Mouraria changed significantly once again. In the late 1970s, the aged buildings and the economic marginalization led to a sharp demographic decrease. It was frequently described as a place of margins and urban "problems," an image that, as we have seen, lingered throughout the twentieth century (Menezes 2004). Simultaneously, though, throughout the 1980s, several populations settled, commercially and residentially, in the area, coming from previous Portuguese colonies, in the context of postcolonial mobilities. From the 1990s, with the transformation of Portugal's position in relation to global flows, Mouraria was renewed with the arrival of new populations, which in the following decades transformed the entire area economically, culturally, and politically. In this context, Mouraria and Martim Moniz square saw their image transformed, now in a multicultural area and revealing the cosmopolitan and modern transformations of Portuguese society. At the same time, the whole area was the subject of new urban transformation projects—the creation of shopping centers (Mouraria shopping center in 1988 and Martim Moniz shopping center in 1992) and the opening of the square (1999). With the arrival of new populations, new expressions of cultural and religious diversity emerged in the public space, such as Todos: Caminhada de Culturas (Altogether: Walk of Cultures), Chinese New Year celebrations, International Mother Language Day (UNESCO), celebration of the anniversary of the recognition of the Sikh religion, and prayers concerning the two main feasts of the Islamic calendar—the feast of the end of Ramadan and the Feast of Sacrifice.

Thus, in the past decades, the image of Mouraria changed significantly, due to the arrival and settlement of migrants from China, Bangladesh, Paki-

stan, Guinea-Bissau, Mozambique, and many others; the statistics mention the existence of fifty-six different nationalities in this area (Fonseca et al. 2012). Mouraria is nowadays described as a place for cultural diversity, multiculturalism, and modernity. So, on one hand, this area of the city somehow evokes several moral panics and normative arguments about the proper urban environment, while at the same time, it is frequently celebrated by several segments as the place for multiculturalism and modernity of Portuguese society. On top of this, Mouraria is still one of the cheapest urban areas close to the city center, and therefore, it is subject to an increasing gentrification and touristic pressure. To understand the construction of this new square, it is imperative having this context in mind.

It is within this larger historical context that in 2012 the Moorish square project, or *praça da Mouraria*, was presented by city hall. The name of this new square is part of the aforementioned process of heritagization and patrimonialization of the figure of the Mouro and its role in Lisbon's history. In a wider sense, this patrimonialization of the Mouro relates to the increasing political and economic importance of the Al-Andalus heritage in contemporary Portuguese society, including for tourism (see Cardeira da Silva 2005), a process that has interesting comparative elements to what is currently happening in Spain (Astor, Burchardt, and Griera 2017; Astor 2019; Hirschkind 2016; Astor 2017). In Lisbon it is possible to find not only guided tours to Islamic Lisbon, organized by private companies, but also touristic plaques that are located in several parts of Mouraria indicating the presence of mosques and other Islamic facilities from the twelfth century (these plaques indicate several layers of history in old Lisbon—not only Islamic).

This architectural project is to be built in one of the main avenues close to Mouraria and includes a new square, a garden, a mosque, with sections for women and men, a multifunctional hall, and a cultural center that will be connected with the Lisbon Photographic Archive (just next door). The decorations of the mosque and the adaptation of the building for religious services will be funded by the Bangladesh Islamic Centre (BIC), an association created in 2004 to manage a mosque located in a small street in the Mouraria neighborhood that has been functioning for the past thirteen years. The transfer of this mosque to the new square means that it will function in one of the main avenues in the area, and thus increase its visibility. A protocol was thus celebrated between city hall and the Islamic Community of Bangladesh in which the funding is partially shared—city hall funds the construction of spaces of public use, including the square and the necessary expropriations, while the religious spaces, its management, and adaptations will be funded by the BIC.

For city hall, the Moorish square, with its reference to Al-Andalus and the presence of the mosque, is part of a larger process of transformation of a run-

down area of the city. In this case, the mobilization of ideas about religious diversity and heritage is also a way of transforming an urban landscape that has a historically ambiguous image in the city. Simultaneously, for city hall, the transfer of this mosque to the future square means solving some previous safety issues and silencing some contestation and complaints from neighbors about the noise and the prayers in the middle of the street. It was also an opportunity to remove this mosque from the inner core of Mouraria and increase its visibility and control. Finally, for local authorities this project is also important, given the growing gentrification and touristic pressure that Lisbon has been facing in the past years.

On the other hand, though, this same project of the Moorish square is associated with more than a decade of negotiations and claims made by a specific segment of Sunni Muslims in the public sphere. The contemporary Baitul Mukarram Mosque in Mouraria began as a small apartment, in the early 2000s, adapted by a group of migrants from Bangladesh to function as a prayer room. This place of worship was created for daily prayer convenience. Simultaneously, it was also part of a larger process of bringing religious/moral order to a world of uncertainties and risks associated with their migration experience in Portugal and in Europe more generally. Over the

Figure 8.2. The Baitul Mukarram Mosque in Mouraria on its inauguration day. © José Mapril.

following years, and as this mosque grew in importance, its premises moved to a whole building and currently occupies a warehouse that serves five hundred to six hundred people per prayer service.

During the two most important prayers—at the end of Ramadan and the Feast of Sacrifice—an adjacent square is used, due to the size of the congregation. This mosque was eventually named after the Dhaka central mosque—Baitul Mukarram—and has been managed by the Bangladesh Islamic Centre (BIC), an association created and recognized by the Portuguese state since 2004. From the moment it grew in importance, the members of the executive committee began negotiations with the Lisbon city council for the creation of an adequate religious and ritual space for Muslims, Bangladeshis and others, in that area of the city.

For the executive committee, the relocation to the new square is essential, having in mind the reduced space for those attending and as a good deed (waqf) to all Muslims, but it is also their recognition as key actors not only locally, in Mouraria, but also within Portuguese public Islam (Salvatore and Eickelman 2004), which has been dominated institutionally by other segments of Sunni Muslims with longer established connections with Portugal through the colonial nexus (see Vakil 2003, 2004; Tiesler 2000; Mapril et al. 2017; Mapril 2014).

Finally, a word about the architectural project itself. The project was designed by a Lisbon architect and extensively presented in international architectural and art forums. Initially, the plan was to open a space between two of the main streets in the Mouraria area—bear in mind that Mouraria is one of the oldest areas of the city, marked by small and narrow streets and alleys. The main objective was, therefore, to foster communication and visibility. According to the architect, this idea of an empty space needed some confinement, some limits, and these were defined by the Moorish reference. Even before the inclusion of a mosque, the idea was to create a space that was evocative of an Islamic heritage. As Mapril's interlocutor argued:

> From the beginning, the Mouraria theme implied a reference to Muslim architecture. This was essential to me and that is why the square was designed as a patio. . . . Thus, the idea of confinement, patio, a moment of silence or the creation of a small oasis was all about Muslim architecture. (Interview, Lisbon, 22 August 2019)

So, the initial plan was to build an open space that evoked an Islamic heritage present in the name of the square, but also in the contemporary configurations of the Moorish quarter. As soon as it was decided that an existing mosque in this area of the city would be transferred to the new square, the project was slightly changed. From then on, the architect collaborated closely with the president of the executive committee of the Bangladesh

Islamic Centre to adapt the space to the transfer of the Baitul Mukarram Mosque. Thus, the Moorish square project was eventually adapted to create an adequate ritual space for Muslims in central Lisbon, including ablution spaces and a minaret. After talks with the BIC, it was decided that the minaret would be slightly withdrawn from public view. The location of the minaret is quite interesting because, among other things, it reveals a kind of ambiguity between an aestheticized heritagized Islamic past, which can be mobilized to build a certain type of cityscape, and the acceptable visibility of lived religion, especially Islam (for comparative discussions, see Verkaaik 2013; Arab 2017). To put it differently, the location of the minaret in the project demonstrates a certain type of non-imposing visibility to Islam in the area. It is as if the idea was to make lived Islam visible but not too imposing or ostensible.

A final note about this case should be included here. This project has been highly discussed in the public sphere, with significant contestation coming from distinct segments but especially among extreme right movements and some segments of the Catholic Church. For the latter, in particular the local representative, local authorities are often criticized because they are abandoning the "proper" Portuguese heritage, namely Catholic churches, in favor of other religions that are not, and we quote, "Portuguese," such as Islam. So, for these segments of the local Catholic Church, Portuguese heritage is mainly Catholic, and this should be the one receiving all the funding and not others.

Between the National and the Global: Concluding Notes

Analyzing both cases from a historical perspective, we have seen that the presence of Catholicism as the main legitimate religion in the country has been, throughout the centuries, the rule. Portugal is making a strong effort to establish a dialogue with religious minorities in order to create an ecumenical society; however, the somehow "hidden" statement behind this religious and political agenda is that this ecumenism should happen under the benevolent supremacy of Catholicism. We believe that although this scenario may have some elements that are exclusive to Portugal, the influence of a Catholic-centered ecumenical discourse related to heritage making is present also in other European countries where Catholicism has played and often still has an important role, like France (Isnart 2012), Spain (Astor, Burchardt, and Griera 2017; Astor 2019), and Poland (see Niedźwiedź, this volume; Baraniecka-Olszewska, this volume).

In spite of their differences, both cases reveal the tensions within the Portuguese governance of religious sites and heritages, tensions that emerge

from the efforts to preserve a Catholic, nationalist Portugal while affirming as well its international, interreligious, and cosmopolitan landscape. These two tendencies, we argue, are linked to the (re)imagination of national identity and belonging based on what constitutes Portuguese religious heritage and its relationship with lived religiosity. The stretching of the limits of what constitutes the "proper" Portuguese heritage is also the result of bottom-up appropriations of the space by religious actors, seen as minorities, that are making claims to citizenship through heritagization and religion.

As we have seen, these tensions of preserving a nationalist, "pure" Portugal while also opening up to other cultures and religions are also embodied in the ways social actors behave in these sites, feeling for instance that certain attitudes, gestures, and behaviors are appropriate and respectful while others are not. To fully grasp the complexities of such phenomena, it is important to pay special attention to the bottom-up appropriation of heritage and religious sites. With this text we hope to open the way for more ethnographic research that pays attention to the often hidden rules about appropriate and inappropriate rules at work at heritage sites and explores the more or less visible influence that Catholicism has on heritage management in Europe and in other countries with a strong Catholic past, such as in Latin America.

Anna Fedele works as an independent anthropological counselor and as a lecturer at the Free University of Bolzano. She is an associated researcher of the Center for Research in Anthropology at the Lisbon University Institute. Her research focuses on religion, ritual, and gender. Fedele is the author of the award-winning monograph *Looking for Mary Magdalene: Alternative Pilgrimage and Ritual Creativity at Catholic Shrines in France* (2013). She is cofounder and editor of the Routledge book series "Gendering the Study of Religion in the Social Sciences." With Kim Knibbe, she coedited *Secular Societies, Spiritual Selves? The Gendered Triangle of Religion, Secularity and Spirituality* (2020).

José Mapril is a PhD in anthropology from the ICS, University of Lisbon, with a thesis on transnationalism and Islam among the Bangladeshis in Lisbon. Currently, he is an assistant professor in the Department of Anthropology at the Universidade Nova de Lisboa and a senior researcher at CRIA NOVA. Since the end of 2018, José has been the coordinator of the executive committee of CRIA. Currently he is developing a project on onward migration, life course, and future among Bangladeshis in Europe and has just finished participation in the HERA project HERILIGION: The Heritagization of Religion and Sacralization of Heritage in Contemporary Europe.

NOTES

1. For a detailed discussion of the relationship between Fátima and the Estado Novo, see Barreto 2004; Cadegan 2004; Torgal 2011; Zimdars-Swartz 1991; and Simpson 2014.
2. For a detailed analysis of the Hindu cult in Fátima and the debates related to it, as well as an overview of Muslim devotion in Fátima, see Joaquim Franco's dissertation "Devotos improváveis: Hindus e Muçulmanos numa visão de Fátima," Universidade Lusófona, 2020.
3. Pedro Gésero, "Configuração da Paisagem Urbana pelos Grupos de Imigrantes: o Martim Moniz na migrantscape de Lisboa," master's thesis., Faculdade de Arquitetura, Lisbon, 2011.

REFERENCES

Arab, Pooyan Tamimi. 2017. *Amplifying Islam in the European Soundscape: Religious Pluralism and the Secularism in the Netherlands*. Oxford: Bloomsbury.

Astor, Avi. 2017. *Rebuilding Islam in Contemporary Spain: The Politics of Mosque Establishments, 1976–2013*. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.

Astor, Avi. 2019. "Polarization and the Limits of Politicization: Cordoba's Mosque-Cathedral and the Politics of Cultural Heritage," *Qualitative Sociology* 42(3): 337–60.

Astor, Avi, Marian Burchardt, and Mar Griera. 2017. "The Politics of Religious Heritage: Framing Claims to Religion as Culture in Spain," *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 56(1): 126–42.

Azevedo, Carlos Moreira, and Luciano Cristino (eds.). 2007. *Enciclopédia de Fátima*. Estoril: Princípia.

Barreto, José. 2004. *Religião e Sociedade. Dois Ensaios*. Lisbon: Imprensa de Ciencias Sociais.

Bastos, Cristiana. 2015. "Entre mundos: Thomaz de Mello Breyner e a clínica de sífilis do Desterro, Lisboa," in Gisel Sanglard et al. (eds.), *Filantropos da Nação: Sociedade, Saúde e Assistência no Brasil e em Portugal*. Rio de Janeiro: Editora FGV, pp. 77–94.

Blanes, Ruy. 2011. "Double Presence: Proselytism and Belonging in an Angolan Prophetic Church's Diaspora in Europe," *Journal of Religion in Europe* 4: 409–28.

Blanes, Ruy, and José Mapril (eds.). 2013. *The Sites and Politics of Religious Diversity in Southern Europe: The Best of All Gods*. Leiden: Brill Publishers.

Bondaz, Julien, Cyril Isnart, and Anaïs Leblon. 2012. "Au-delà du consensus patrimonial: Résistances et usages contestataires du patrimoine," *Civilisations: Revue i Internationale d'Anthropologie et de Sciences Humaines* 61(1): 9–22.

Cadegan, Una M. 2004. "The Queen of Peace in the Shadow of War: Fátima and U.S. Catholic Anticommunism," *U.S. Catholic Historian* 22 (4): 1–15.

Cardeira da Silva, Maria. 2005. "O sentido dos Árabes no nosso sentido," *Análise Social* 173: 781–806.

Castles, Stephen, and Mark Miller. 1997. *The Age of Migration*. New York: Guilford Press.

Christian, William A. 1996. *Visionaries: The Spanish Republic and the Reign of Christ*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Claverie, Elisabeth. 2003. *Les Guerres de La Vierge: Une Anthropologie Des Apparitions*. NRF Essais. Paris: Gallimard.

Coleman, Simon, and John Eade (eds.). 2018. *Pilgrimage and Political Economy: Translating the Sacred*. Oxford and New York: Berghahn Books.

Eade, John, and Michael Sallnow. 1991. *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*. London and New York: Routledge.

Estevens, Ana. 2018. *A Cidade Neoliberal*. Lisbon: Deriva Editores.

Fedele, Anna. 2017. "Pellegrinaggio, Topografia Sacra e Religione Vissuta a Fátima," *Annali di Studi Religiosi* 18: 83–95.

Fedele, Anna. 2020a. "Walking Pilgrimages to the Marian Shrine of Fátima in Portugal as Democratic Explorations," in Graham Harvey et al. (eds.), *Reassembling Democracy: Ritual as Cultural Resource*. London: Bloomsbury, pp. 105–24.

Fedele, Anna. 2020b. "'God Wants Spiritual Fruits Not Religious Nuts': Spirituality as a Middle Way between Religion and Secularism at the Marian Shrine of Fátima," in Anna Fedele and Kim E. Knibbe (eds.), *Secular Societies, Spiritual Selves? The Gendered Triangle of Religion, Secularity and Spirituality*. London, New York: Routledge, pp. 166–83.

Fonseca, M., et al. (eds.). 2012. *Modes of Inter-ethnic Coexistence in Three Neighbourhoods in the Lisbon Metropolitan Area: A Comparative Perspective*. Lisbon: Colibri.

Gaspar, Jorge. 1985. "A cidade portuguesa na Idade Média. Aspetos da estrutura física e desenvolvimento funcional," in Emilio Satz, Margarita Cantera Montenegro, and Cristina Segura Graino (eds.), *La Ciudad Hispánica durante los siglos XIII al XVI: Actas del coloquio celebrado en La Rabida y Sevilla del 14 al 19 de septiembre de 1981*. Madrid: Editorial da Universidad Complutense, pp. 133–47.

Gemzöe, Lena. 2000. *Feminine Matters: Women's Religious Practices in a Portuguese Town*. Södertälje, Sweden: Stockholm University.

Hermkens, Anna-Karina, Willy Jansen, and Catrien Notermans (eds.). 2009. *Moved by Mary: The Power of Pilgrimage in the Modern World*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.

Hirschkind, Charles. 2016. "Granadan Reflections," *Material Religion* 12(2): 209–32.

Isnart, Cyril. 2012. "The Mayor, the Ancestors and the Chapel: Clientelism, Emotion and Heritagisation in Southern France," *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 18(5): 479–94.

Isnart, Cyril. 2014. "Changing the Face of Catholicism in a Tourist Context: Heritage Care, Ritual Dynamics, and the Rhetoric of Transformation of a Religious Minority in Greece," *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change* 12(2): 133–49.

Jansen, Willy, and Meike Kühl. 2008. "Shared symbols: Muslims, Marian Pilgrimages and Gender," *European Journal of Women's Studies* 15(3): 295–311.

King, Russel, et al. (eds.). 2000. *Eldorado or Fortress? Migration in Southern Europe*. London: Macmillan Press.

Lopes, Policarpo. 1989. "Le pèlerinage à Fátima: Une expression mystique du sacré populaire," *Social Compass* 36(2): 187–99.

Lourenço, Inês, and Rita Cachado. 2018. "Hindu Diaspora in Portugal: The Case of Our Lady of Fátima Devotion," in Pankaj et al. (eds.), *Hinduism and Tribal Religions: Encyclopedia of Indian Religions*. Leiden: Springer Netherlands, pp. 1–18.

Mapril, José. 2014. "'Aren't You Looking for Citizenship in the Wrong Place?' Islamic Education, Secular Subjectivities, and the Portuguese Muslim," *Religion and Society: Advances in Research* **5: 65–82.**

Mapril, José, et al. (eds.). 2017. *Secularisms in a Post Secular Age? Religiosities and Subjectivities*. London: Palgrave.

Menezes, Marlucci. 2004. *Mouraria: Retalhos de um Imaginário*. Oeiras: Celta editores.

Orsi, Robert A. 2010. *The Madonna of 115th Street: Faith and Community in Italian Harlem, 1880–1950*. Yale University Press.

Pereira, Pedro. 2003. *Peregrinos: um Estudo Antropológico das Peregrinações a Pé a Fátima*. Lisbon: Instituto Piaget.

Perry, Nicholas, and Loreto Echeverria. 1988. *Under the Heel of Mary*. London and New York: Routledge.

Salvatore, Armando, and Dale Eickelman. 2004. *Public Islam and the Common Good*. Leiden: Brill.

Sarró, R., and Anne Mélice. 2011. "Kongo and Lisbon: The Dialectics of 'Center' and 'Periphery' in the Kimbanguist Church," in Sandra Fancello and Andre Mary (eds.), *Chrétiens Africans en Europe*. Paris: Karthala, pp. 43–67.

Scheer, Monique. 2006. *Rosenkranz und Kriegsvisionen: Marienerscheinungskulte im 20. Jahrhundert*. Tübingen: Tübinger Vereinigung für Volkskunde e.V.

Simpson, Duncan. 2014. *A Igreja Católica e o Estado Novo Salazarista*. Lisbon: Edições 70.

Teixeira, Alfredo. 2019. *A Religião na Sociedade Portuguesa*. Lisbon: Fundação Francisco Manuel dos Santos.

Tiesler, Nina. 2000. "Muçulmanos na margem: A nova presença islâmica em Portugal," *Sociologia: Problemas e Práticas* 34: 117–44.

Torgal, Luís Filipe. 2011. *O Sol Bailou ao Meio Dia: a Criação de Fátima*. Lisbon: Tinta-da-China.

Torgal, Luís Filipe. 2017. *Fátima, a (Des)construção do Mito*. Coimbra: Palimage.

Turner, Bryan S. 2011. *Religion and Modern Society: Citizenship, Secularization and the State*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Vakil, Abdoolkarim. 2003. "Muslims in Portugal: History, Historiography, Citizenship," *Euroclio Bulletin* 18: 9–13.

Vakil, Abdoolkarim. 2004. "Pensar o Islão: Questões coloniais, interrogações pós-coloniais," *Revista Crítica de Ciências Sociais* 69: 17–52.

Vakil, Abdoolkarim, Fernando Monteiro, and Mário Machaqueiro. 2011. *Moçambique: Memória Falado do Islão e da Guerra*. Coimbra: Almedina.

Verkaaik, Oscar. 2013. *Religious Architecture: Anthropological Perspectives*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Vilaça, Helena. 2006. *Da Torre de Babel às Terras Prometidas: Pluralismo Religioso em Portugal*. Coimbra: Afrontamento.

Vilaça, Helena, and Maria João Oliveira. 2019. *A Religião no Espaço Público Português*. Lisbon: INCM.

Zimdars-Swartz, Sandra L. 1991. *Encountering Mary: From La Salette to Medjugorje*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.